

# Guarding the Gates



*David Goutor*

Guarding the Gates:  
The Canadian Labour Movement  
and Immigration, 1872-1934



**UBC**Press · Vancouver · Toronto

© UBC Press 2007

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without prior written permission of the publisher, or, in Canada, in the case of photocopying or other reprographic copying, a licence from Access Copyright (Canadian Copyright Licensing Agency), [www.accesscopyright.ca](http://www.accesscopyright.ca).

16 15 14 13 12 11 10 09 08 07 5 4 3 2 1

Printed in Canada on ancient-forest-free paper (100% post-consumer recycled) that is processed chlorine- and acid-free, with vegetable-based inks.

---

#### Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Goutor, David, 1969-

Guarding the gates : the Canadian labour movement and immigration, 1872-1934 / David Goutor.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-7748-1364-8

1. Labor unions – Canada – History. 2. Immigrants – Employment – Canada – History. 3. Canada – Emigration and immigration – Government policy – History. 4. Canada – Emigration and immigration – History. 5. Race discrimination – Canada – History. I. Title.

JV7225.G68 2007 331.880971 C2007-901280-9

---

## Canada

UBC Press gratefully acknowledges the financial support for our publishing program of the Government of Canada through the Book Publishing Industry Development Program (BPIDP), and of the Canada Council for the Arts, and the British Columbia Arts Council.

This book has been published with the help of a grant from the Canadian Federation for the Humanities and Social Sciences, through the Aid to Scholarly Publications Programme, using funds provided by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada.

UBC Press  
The University of British Columbia  
2029 West Mall  
Vancouver, BC V6T 1Z2  
604.822.5959 / Fax 604.822.6083  
[www.ubcpress.ca](http://www.ubcpress.ca)

*This book is dedicated to my wife, Lisa.*



# Contents

Illustrations / viii  
Acknowledgments / ix

## **PART 1: ISSUES AND ARGUMENTS**

- 1 Guarding the Gates / 3
- 2 Setting the Stage: Labour, Industry, and Immigration in Canada, 1872-1934 / 11

## **PART 2: LABOUR'S ANTI-ASIAN AGITATION**

- 3 The Bounds of Unity: Opposition to Chinese Immigration, 1880-87 / 35
- 4 The "Old Time Question": The Campaign for Exclusion, 1888-1934 / 60

## **PART 3: LABOUR AND ATLANTIC IMMIGRATION**

- 5 Superfluous People: Labour's Construction of Immigrants from Europe and the British Isles / 87
- 6 Importing Victims: The Assault on the Commerce of Immigration / 115

## **PART 4: IMMIGRATION, IDEOLOGY, AND POLITICS**

- 7 Immigration, Joseph Arch, and the Producer Ideology, 1872-79 / 145
- 8 Imported Labour, the Tariff, and Land Reform, 1880-1902 / 170
- 9 Retreat, Corporatism, and Responsible Management, 1903-34 / 191

Conclusion / 208

Notes / 215  
Bibliography / 252  
Index / 264

# Illustrations

- 15 Staff of the *Voice*, the main press outlet for labour in Manitoba. Photo by Campbell, c. 1897. Archives of Manitoba, neg. N23271
- 19 Pat Draper, a skilled printer for the federal government in Ottawa and a dominant figure in the Trades and Labor Congress in the early twentieth century. *Congress Journal*, December 1928
- 20 Tom Moore, TLC president from 1918 to 1935. *Congress Journal*, December 1928
- 24 Cartoon capturing important parts of unionists' position. *Industrial Banner*, 31 July 1914
- 64 Cartoon from 1896 TLC convention showing opposition to Asian immigration. *Globe*, 19 September 1896
- 74 Cartoon from the *Voice*, 13 September 1907, showing class and gender components of labour's anti-Asian rhetoric. Archives of Manitoba
- 94 Daniel O'Donoghue, a prominent supporter of the Liberal Party and a key figure in the Ontario Knights of Labor, c. 1907. Archives of Manitoba, neg. N4492
- 155 Joseph Arch, president of the National Agricultural Labourers' Union in England. Courtesy of the Warden and Fellows of Nuffield College, Oxford
- 184 Delegates at the 1890 TLC convention in Ottawa. Reprinted in *Congress Journal*, October 1926
- 204 Representatives of labour organizations at the 1927 convention of the International Labour Organization. *Congress Journal*, August 1927



# Acknowledgments

Completing this book would not have been possible without the support of many people. I should acknowledge first of all those who helped with this project since it began as a doctoral thesis at the University of Toronto. I would like to thank my supervisor, Ian Radforth, particularly for his ability to simplify an often complicated process and keep me focused on the main goal. My gratitude also goes to members of my thesis committee: Franca Iacovetta, Rick Halpern, Laurel MacDowell, and my external examiner, Gregory Kealey, for their fairness and their constructive comments on my work. Franca's enthusiasm for these subjects has been an inspiration since I was a master's student, and Rick has provided great intellectual and moral support since arriving at the University of Toronto in 2001. I would also like to thank the members of the Toronto Labour Studies Group for their comments on my work, perspective on the issues I confronted, and especially for making me feel part of a community of scholars in labour history. In particular, I have received a lot of support from Craig Heron, Bettina Bradbury, Magda Fahrni, and above all, Steve (Arlo) Penfold.

I also want to thank the reviewers and editors who helped me produce two articles based on material that has also been developed in this book. Some parts of Chapters 3 and 4 appeared in "Drawing Different Lines of Colour: The Mainstream English Canadian Labour Movement's Approach to Blacks and the Chinese 1880-1914," *Labor: Studies in Working Class History of the Americas* 2, 1 (Spring 2005): 55-76. Parts of Chapter 7 appeared in "'Stand by the Union, Mr. Arch': The Toronto Labour Establishment and the Emigration Mission of Britain's National Agricultural Labourers' Union," *Labour/Le Travail* 55, (Spring 2005): 9-36.

I owe a great debt to a number of people in the history department at the University of Toronto. Professors Michael Wayne, John Ingham, Bill Dick, and Martin Klein have offered great instruction and direction over the years. I am especially thankful to Arthur Silver for supervising my comprehensive exams and for lending a sympathetic ear. Among my fellow graduate students,

I have been lucky to enjoy both the intellectual stimulation and the friendship of many people, including Wendy Cuthbertson, Ruth Percy, Katrina Srigley, Jenny Carson, Barrington Walker, Nathan Smith, Jeff Bowersox, Rezza Pirbai, Shelley McKellar, Eva Plach, and Blaine Chiasson. I offer special thanks to Jim Delaney for his ferocious wit – and for picking up more than his share of the tab on many occasions.

In the process of turning my thesis into a book, I have received first-rate guidance from the people at UBC Press. In particular, a key break in this process occurred at the Canadian Historical Association conference in 2002, when I happened to run into an old friend from my undergraduate days who had become an editor at the Press. Since that meeting, I have benefited from Emily Andrew's skills, enthusiasm, and experience in the world of publishing.

Since I joined the Labour Studies Programme at McMaster University in 2005, the faculty and staff have provided an ideal environment. Donald Wells, Robert Storey, Greg McElligott, Marlea Clarke, and Donna Baines, and especially Charlotte Yates and Wayne Lewchuk, have given me fresh insights and encouragement. My thanks also go to friends I made at Seneca College, especially Peter Meehan, Mark Moss, Jim Moran, and Camille Soucie.

A special note also goes to many staff members who often go without the acknowledgment they deserve. I am grateful to the people at the Inter-Library Loan department at Robarts Library at the University of Toronto for their endless patience and professionalism in dealing with frazzled researchers like me, and their remarkable proficiency in tracking down and obtaining obscure sources. The people at the microfilm room at Robarts offered valuable help and sympathy through many hours of scouring old newspapers and records. I am indebted to the staff at the history department at the University of Toronto, especially Louise Nugent, Marion Harris, Rae Billing and above all Jennifer Francisco for helping to guide me through the maze of university regulations and requirements, and for their unfailing good humour. Sharon Molnar and Delia Hutchinson have been invaluable in making me feel acclimated and comfortable at McMaster.

My thanks go to those at CUPE 3902, including especially Steven Pender, Klaus Jahn, Rob Penfold, Thor Burnham, Mikael Swayze, Archana Rampure, and Chantal Sundaram, who have been good comrades and better pals. To Myles Ruggles, Mitchell Shore, Dong-Ju Kwon, Judy Madjarian, Marnie McGregor, Shannon Olliffe, and Beth Pettigrew, I can only express my gratitude that I have such good friends.

My deepest thanks, of course, go to my family. Without my mom and dad, it is difficult to imagine how I could have started a graduate degree, let alone finished a scholarly book. Cliff, Irma, and Mark Orchard, and Hans Ibing have been generous with their support and love in these past years. Having my sister Jackie, and Vince and Emilie here in Toronto has made an immeasurable difference.